

# **A critical analysis of the disinvestment process in India**

A dissertation submitted to the

**National Law School  
University of India**

in part-fulfillment of the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy

By:  
**Prasenjit Mukherjee**

**National Law School University of India**

**Bangalore**

**2008**

## DECLARATION

I do hereby declare that this thesis entitled '**A critical analysis of the disinvestment process in India**' has been carried out by me under the supervision of Prof. (Dr) A. Jayagovind, Vice Chancellor, National Law School of India University (NLSIU). This work has not been submitted for any degree at any other university. This work, in part or in whole, has not been published so far.

Bangalore

Date: 1. 3. 08

  
Prasenjit Mukherjee

## CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that this thesis entitled  
**'A critical analysis of the disinvestment process in  
India'**  
submitted by Prasenjit Mukherjee for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy (Ph. D)  
is the record of bonafide research carried out by him  
under my supervision

Bangalore

Date: 3 - 3 - 08

*A. Jayagovind*

Prof. (Dr) A. Jayagovind  
Vice Chancellor  
National Law School of India University,  
Bangalore

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am thankful to all those who in one way or another contributed to the completion of this dissertation.

First and foremost, I must express my gratitude to Prof. (Dr) A. Jayagovind, Vice Chancellor of the National Law School of India University (NLSIU) for not only agreeing to be my guide, but also for all his help and guidance in completing the work on time.

I am also grateful to Prof. Pillai, Prof. Ramesh, and Dr Vijayakumar, Registrar of NLSIU for their comments and suggestions. They have helped to focus on certain new areas, which has resulted in significant improvement.

I also greatly benefited from the discussions I had in this connection with Prof M. S. Narasimhan in the Indian Institute of Management (IIM), Bangalore who provided me with a bibliography of books on the subject and helped me in accessing the IIM-B library, without which this would not have been possible.

I had the good fortune of visiting the Institute of Public Enterprises at Hyderabad and interacting with its Director, Prof R. K. Mishra, who is both very knowledgeable on the subject, and also extremely helpful.

Similarly, I had interactions with my batchmate and good friend, Shri Sanjeev Ahluwalia when he was Joint Secretary in the Department of Disinvestment at New Delhi. I am thankful both to him and to the other colleagues in the Department of Disinvestment for sharing their thoughts with me on the subject and helping me out with material published by the Department, which has been duly acknowledged in the references.

I have earlier had the good fortune of studying under Dr Paul Cook, one of the greatest scholars on the subject of privatization, during my stint in UMIST between 1995-96. I have to acknowledge my gratitude to him as well as to UMIST and IDPM in this regard.

Lastly, I would be failing in my duties if I do not acknowledge the role which another batchmate and dear friend of mine played in this entire thing. Dr Anup Pujari, presently Joint Secretary in the Department of Economic Affairs in Government of India, first encouraged me to register myself for my Ph. D with NLSIU. He has also been tracking my progress and encouraging me at every stage. But for him, I do not think this would have happened.

My wife and sons have also been very supportive of my decision to go ahead with this project so late in my life. As with everything else, their love and support is what has sustained me throughout.

## LIST OF TABLES

| Table No. | Title                                                                  | Page No. |
|-----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|
| 3.1       | Public Corporations in 1979                                            | 58       |
| 3.2       | Privatization proceeds                                                 | 67       |
| 3.3       | Public asset sales in the UK, 1979-91                                  | 71       |
| 3.4       | Pricing of shares in privatized companies                              | 78       |
| 3.5       | Pricing of shares                                                      | 81       |
| 3.6       | Cost of major asset sales                                              | 82       |
| 3.7       | Five UK companies: the costs of privatization, 1984-87                 | 83       |
| 3.8       | Size of privatized company share registers in the UK                   | 93       |
| 3.9       | Number of companies invested in by individual shareholders in UK, 1987 | 94       |
| 3.10      | Increase in UK directors' salaries after privatization                 | 96       |
| 5.1       | Growth of Central PSEs in India                                        | 148      |
| 5.2       | Profitability Profile of Central PSEs                                  | 153      |
| 5.3       | Profitability Profile of Public Sector Enterprises: 1995-2000          | 156      |
| 6.1       | Fiscal imbalances and internal debt of the central government          | 177      |
| 6.2       | Deficit of Central Government: 1975-76 to 1990-91                      | 178      |
| 6.3       | Current account deficits, external debt and debt servicing             | 179      |
| 7.1       | List of PSEs disinvested in 1991-92                                    | 225      |
| 7.2       | Estimated loss to Government                                           | 228      |
| 7.3       | Receipt of bids – First tranche                                        | 229      |
| 7.4       | Allotments made – First tranche                                        | 230      |
| 7.5       | Receipt of bids – Second tranche                                       | 231      |
| 7.6       | Reduction in reserve price                                             | 233      |
| 7.7       | Under-realization due to reduction in reserve price                    | 234      |
| 7.8       | Under-pricing of shares as compared to market prices                   | 235      |
| 7.9       | Disinvestment in 1992-93 – First tranche                               | 239      |
| 7.10      | Disinvestment in 1992-93 – Second tranche                              | 239      |
| 7.11      | Disinvestment in 1992-93 – Third tranche                               | 240      |
| 7.12      | Disinvestment in 1994-95 – First tranche                               | 242      |
| 7.13      | Disinvestment in 1994-95 – Second tranche                              | 243      |
| 7.14      | Disinvestment in 1994-95 – Third tranche                               | 243      |
| 7.15      | Disinvestment in 1995-96                                               | 244      |
| 7.16      | Valuation of shares by different methods                               | 249      |
| 7.17      | Actual and Realizable Value from sale of shares divested               | 250      |

| <b>Table No.</b> | <b>Title</b>                                    | <b>Page No.</b> |
|------------------|-------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| 8.1              | Modalities of disinvestment of PSEs             | 261             |
| 8.2              | PSEs disinvested in 1998-99                     | 270             |
| 8.3              | PSEs disinvested in 1999-2000                   | 271             |
| 8.4              | Disinvestment in 2000-2001                      | 272             |
| 8.5              | Disinvestment in 2001-2002                      | 275             |
| 8.6              | Disinvestment in 2002-2003                      | 279             |
| 8.7              | Disinvestment in 2003-2004                      | 280             |
| 8.8              | Percentage of shares offered to employees       | 281             |
| 8.9              | Disinvestment from 1991-92 till 2007-2008       | 291             |
| 8.10             | Strategic sales from 1999-2000 to 2004-2005     | 295             |
| 8.11             | Details of status of disinvestment in nine PSUs | 306             |
| 9.1              | Record of Disinvestment: 1991-92 to 1995-96     | 319             |
| 9.2              | Budgetary Support: 1991-92 to 1995-96           | 320             |
| 9.3              | Record of Disinvestment: 1996-97 to 1998-99     | 322             |
| 9.4              | Budgetary Support: 1996-97 to 2000-2001         | 323             |
| 9.5              | Record of Disinvestment: 1999-2000 to 2003-2004 | 324             |

## LIST OF FIGURES

| <b>Figure No.</b> | <b>Title</b>                                               | <b>Page No.</b> |
|-------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| Figure 1          | No. of SOEs privatized worldwide by region, 1980-91        | 103             |
| Figure 2          | No. of SOEs privatized in developing countries, 1980-91    | 103             |
| Figure 3          | Sectoral Distribution of Privatization Proceeds: 1990-2003 | 107             |
| Figure 4          | FDI figures for India and China                            | 201             |